24(2): 1-8, 2017; Article no.JAMCS.35842 *Previously known as British Journal of Mathematics* & *Computer Science*

ISSN: 2231-0851

Asymptotic Behavior of the System of Second Order Nonlinear Difference Equations

Hongmei Bao¹ *∗*

¹*Faculty of Mathematics and Physics, Huaiyin Institute of Technology, Huai'an, Jiangsu 223003, P.R. China.*

Author's contribution

The sole author designed, analyzed and interpreted and prepared the manuscript.

Article Information

DOI: 10.9734/JAMCS/2017/35842 *Editor(s):* (1) Dijana Mosic, Department of Mathematics, University of Nis, Serbia. *Reviewers:* (1) Hugo Cruz-Suarez, Benemerita Universidad Autonoma de Puebla, Mexico. (2) S. Kalabu Sic, University of Rhode Island, USA. Complete Peer review History: http://www.sciencedomain.org/review-history/20799

[Received: 31](http://www.sciencedomain.org/review-history/20799)st July 2017 Accepted: 24th August 2017 Short Research Articles Published: 2nd September 2017

Abstract

This paper deals with dynamics of the solutions to the system of second order nonlinear difference equations

$$
x_{n+1} = \frac{x_n}{A + y_n y_{n-1}}, \quad y_{n+1} = \frac{y_n}{B + x_n x_{n-1}}, \quad n = 0, 1, \cdots,
$$

where $A \in (0, \infty), x_{-i} \in (0, \infty), y_{-i} \in (0, \infty), i = 0, 1$. Moreover we use the known results to determine the rate of convergence of the solutions of this system. Finally, we give some numerical examples to justify our results.

Keywords: Difference equation; stability; rate of convergence.

MSC: 39A10, 39A20.

**Corresponding author: E-mail: baohmmath@126.com.cn, bhmmath@163.com;*

1 Introduction

Difference equations or discrete dynamical systems are diverse field which impacts almost every branch of pure and applied mathematics. One of the reasons is a necessity for some techniques which can be used in investigating equations arising in mathematical models describing real life situations in population biology, economic, probability theory, genetics psychology, etc. The theory of difference equations occupies a central position in applicable analysis. There is no doubt that the theory of difference equations will continue to play an important role in mathematics as a whole. Rational difference equations of order greater than one are of paramount importance in applications. Such equations also appear naturally as discrete analogues and as numerical solutions of differential and delay differential equations. It is very interesting to investigate the behavior of solutions to rational difference equations and to discuss the local asymptotic stability of their equilibrium points. Recently there has been published quite a lot of works concerning the behavior of positive solutions of systems of difference equations [1-10]. These results are not only valuable in their own right, but also they can provide insight into their differential counterparts.

Kurbanli [3] studied a three-dimensional system of rational difference equations

$$
x_{n+1} = \frac{x_{n-1}}{y_n x_{n-1} - 1}, \ y_{n+1} = \frac{y_{n-1}}{x_n y_{n-1} - 1}, \ z_{n+1} = \frac{z_{n-1}}{y_n z_{n-1} - 1},
$$

where the initial conditions are arbitrary real numbers.

Cinar et al. [4] have obtained the positive solution of the difference equation system

$$
x_{n+1} = \frac{m}{y}_n, \ y_{n+1} = \frac{py_n}{x_{n-1}y_{n-1}}
$$

.

Cinar [5] has obtained the positive solution of the difference equation system

$$
x_{n+1} = \frac{1}{y_n}, \ y_{n+1} = \frac{y_n}{x_{n-1}y_{n-1}}.
$$

Clark and Kulenovic [6] investigated the system of rational difference equations

$$
x_{n+1} = \frac{x_n}{a + cy_n}, \quad y_{n+1} = \frac{y_n}{b + dx_n}, \quad n = 0, 1, \dots
$$

where $a, b, c, d \in (0, \infty)$ and the initial conditions x_0 and y_0 are arbitrary nonnegative numbers.

Zhang, Yang and Liu [7] investigated the global behavior for a system of the following third order nonlinear difference equations.

$$
x_{n+1} = \frac{x_{n-2}}{B + y_{n-2}y_{n-1}y_n}, \ \ y_{n+1} = \frac{y_{n-2}}{A + x_{n-2}x_{n-1}x_n},
$$

where $A, B \in (0, \infty)$, and initial values $x_{-i}, y_{-i} \in (0, \infty)$, $i = 0, 1, 2$.

Ibrahim [9] has obtained the positive solution of the difference equation system in the modeling competitive populations.

$$
x_{n+1} = \frac{x_{n-1}}{x_{n-1}y_n + \alpha}, \ \ y_{n+1} = \frac{y_{n-1}}{y_{n-1}x_n + \beta}.
$$

Din et al. [10] studied the global behavior of positive solution to the fourth-order rational difference equations

$$
x_{n+1} = \frac{\alpha x_{n-3}}{\beta + \gamma y_n y_{n-1} y_{n-2} y_{n-3}}, \ \ y_{n+1} = \frac{\alpha_1 y_{n-3}}{\beta_1 + \gamma_1 x_n x_{n-1} x_{n-2} x_{n-3}}.
$$

where the parameters $\alpha, \beta, \gamma, \alpha_1, \beta_1, \gamma_1$ and the initial conditions $x_{-i}, y_{-i}, i = 0, 1, 2, 3$, are positive real numbers.

Although difference equations are sometimes very simple in their forms, they are extremely difficult to understand thoroughly the behavior of their solutions. In [11], Kocic and Ladas have studied global behavior of nonlinear difference equations of higher order. Similar nonlinear systems of difference equations were investigated (see [12-20]).

Our aim in this paper is to investigate the solutions, stability character and asymptotic behavior of the system of difference equations

$$
x_{n+1} = \frac{x_n}{A + y_n y_{n-1}}, \quad y_{n+1} = \frac{y_n}{B + x_n x_{n-1}}, \quad n = 0, 1, \cdots,
$$
\n(1.1)

where $A, B \in (0, \infty)$ and initial conditions $x_i, y_i \in (0, \infty), i = -1, 0$.

2 Main Results

Let I_x, I_y be closed intervals of real numbers and $f: I_x^2 \times I_y^2 \to I_x, g: I_x^2 \times I_y^2 \to I_y$ be continuously differentiable functions. Then for every initial conditions $(x_i, y_i) \in I_x \times I_y(i = -1, 0)$, the system of difference equations

$$
\begin{cases}\n x_{n+1} = f(x_n, x_{n-1}, y_n, y_{n-1}), \\
 y_{n+1} = g(x_n, x_{n-1}, y_n, y_{n-1}),\n\end{cases}
$$
\n(2.1)

has a unique solution $\{(x_n, y_n)\}_{n=-1}^{\infty}$. A point $(\bar{x}, \bar{y}) \in I_x \times I_y$ is called an equilibrium point of (2.1) if $\bar{x} = f(\bar{x}, \bar{x}, \bar{y}, \bar{y}), \bar{y} = g(\bar{x}, \bar{x}, \bar{y}, \bar{y}),$ i. e., $(x_n, y_n) = (\bar{x}, \bar{y})$ for all $n \geq 0$.

Definition 2.1 *Assume that* (\bar{x}, \bar{y}) *be a fixed point of (2.1). Then*

 (i) (\bar{x}, \bar{y}) *is said to be stable relative to* $I_x \times I_y$ *if for every* $\varepsilon > 0$ *, there exists* $\delta > 0$ *such that for* any initial conditions $(x_i, y_i) \in I_x \times I_y (i = -1, 0)$, with $\sum_{i=-1}^{0} |x_i - \bar{x}| < \delta$, $\sum_{i=-1}^{0} |y_i - \bar{y}| < \delta$, *implies* $|x_n - \bar{x}| < \varepsilon$, $|y_n - \bar{y}| < \varepsilon$.

(ii) (\bar{x}, \bar{y}) is called an attractor relative to $I_x \times I_y$ if for all $(x_i, y_i) \in I_x \times I_y$ $(i = -1, 0)$, $\lim_{n \to \infty} x_n =$ \bar{x} , $\lim_{n\to\infty} y_n = \bar{y}$.

 (iii) (\bar{x}, \bar{y}) *is called asymptotically stable relative to* $I_x \times I_y$ *if it is stable and an attractor.*

(*iv*) *Unstable if it is not stable.*

Theorem 2.1.[11] *Assume that* $X(n + 1) = F(X(n)), n = 0, 1, \cdots$, *is a system of difference equations, and* \overline{X} *is the equilibrium point of this system i.e.,* $F(\overline{X}) = \overline{X}$ *. If all eigenvalues of the Jacobian matrix* J_F , evaluated at \overline{X} *lie inside the open unit disk* $|\lambda| < 1$, then \overline{X} *is locally asymptotically stable. If one of them has modulus greater than one then* \overline{X} *is unstable.*

Clearly, system (1.1) has always trivial equilibrium $(0,0)$. If $0 < A < 1, 0 < B < 1$, system (1.1) α clearly, system (1.1) has always trivial equilibrium $(0, 0)$.
has a unique positive equilibrium point $(\sqrt{1 - B}, \sqrt{1 - A})$.

Theorem 2.2. *Consider system (1.1), then the following statements are true:*

(*i*) If $0 < A < 1, 0 < B < 1$, then the trivial equilibrium point $(0,0)$ is unstable. (ii) *If* $A > 1, B > 1$ *, then the trivial equilibrium point* $(0,0)$ *is locally asymptotically stable.*

Proof. We can obtain easily the linearized system of (1.1) about the positive equilibrium $(0,0)$ is

$$
\Phi_{n+1} = B\Phi_n \tag{2.2}
$$

where

$$
\Phi_n = \begin{pmatrix} x_n \\ x_{n-1} \\ y_n \\ y_{n-1} \end{pmatrix}, \quad B = \frac{\partial F}{\partial X_n}|_{(0,0)} = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{1}{A} & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & \frac{1}{B} & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \end{pmatrix}
$$

The characteristic equation of (2.2) is

$$
\lambda^2(\lambda - \frac{1}{A})(\lambda - \frac{1}{B}) = 0
$$
\n(2.3)

(i) If $0 < A < 1, 0 < B < 1$, This shows that two roots of characteristic equation lie outside unit disk. So the trivial equilibrium point $(0,0)$ is a repeler, i.e. it is unstable.

(ii) If $A > 1, B > 1$, The all roots of characteristic equation lie inside unit disk. So the trivial equilibrium point $(0,0)$ is a source, i.e. it is locally asymptotically stable.

Theorem 2.3 *Suppose that* $A > 1, B > 1$ *hold, then the trivial equilibrium point* $(0,0)$ *is globally asymptotically stable.*

Proof. For $A > 1, B > 1$, from (ii) of Theorem 2.2, the equilibrium point $(0,0)$ is locally asymptotically stable. From (1.1), it is easy to see every positive solution (x_n, y_n) is bounded. i.e. $0 < x_n < x_0, 0 < y_n < y_0$. Now it is sufficient to prove that the sequences $\{x_n\}$ and $\{y_n\}$ are decreasing. From (1.1), we have

$$
\frac{x_{n+1}}{x_n} = \frac{1}{A + y_n y_{n-1}} \le \frac{1}{A} < 1, \quad \frac{y_{n+1}}{y_n} = \frac{1}{B + x_n x_{n-1}} \le \frac{1}{B} < 1.
$$

This implies that the sequences $\{x_n\}$ and $\{y_n\}$ are decreasing. Hence $\lim_{n\to\infty} x_n = 0$, $\lim_{n\to\infty} y_n = 0$ 0*.* Therefore the trivial equilibrium point (0*,* 0) is globally asymptotically stable.

Theorem 2.4 *Assume that* $0 < A < 1, 0 < B < 1$. Then the positive equilibrium point $(\bar{x}, \bar{y}) =$ $(\sqrt{1-B}, \sqrt{1-A})$ *is locally unstable.*

Proof. We can obtain easily the linearized system of (1.1) about the positive equilibrium (\bar{x}, \bar{y}) is

$$
\Phi_{n+1} = G\Phi_n \tag{2.4}
$$

where $\Phi_n = (x_n, x_{n-1}, y_n, y_{n-1})^T$,

$$
G = \frac{\partial F}{\partial X_n}|_{(\bar{x}, \bar{y})} = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{1}{A} & 0 & -\bar{x}\bar{y} & -\bar{x}\bar{y} \\ 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ -\bar{x}\bar{y} & -\bar{x}\bar{y} & \frac{1}{B} & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \end{pmatrix}
$$

Let $\lambda_1, \lambda_2, \lambda_3, \lambda_4$ denote the 4 eigenvalues of Matrix *G*. Let $D = \text{diag}(d_1, d_2, d_3, d_4), d_i \neq 0$ (*i* = 1*,* 2*,* 3*,* 4) be a diagonal matrix,

Clearly *D* is invertible. Computing *DGD−*¹ , we obtained

$$
DGD^{-1} = \left(\begin{array}{cccc} \frac{1}{A} & 0 & -\frac{d_1}{d_3} \bar{x} \bar{y} & -\frac{d_1}{d_4} \bar{x} \bar{y} \\ \frac{d_2}{d_1} & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ -\frac{d_3}{d_1} \bar{x} \bar{y} & -\frac{d_3}{d_2} \bar{x} \bar{y} & \frac{1}{B} & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & \frac{d_4}{d_3} & 0 \end{array} \right)
$$

It is well known that *G* has the same eigenvalues as *DGD−*¹ , we obtain that

$$
\max_{1 \le k \le 4} |\lambda_k| = ||DGD^{-1}||
$$

=
$$
\max \left\{ d_2 d_1^{-1}, d_4 d_3^{-1}, \frac{1}{A} + \frac{d_1}{d_3} \bar{x} \bar{y} + \frac{d_1}{d_4} \bar{x} \bar{y},
$$

$$
\frac{1}{B} + \frac{d_3}{d_1} \bar{x} \bar{y} + \frac{d_3}{d_2} \bar{x} \bar{y} \right\}
$$

> 1

It follows from Theorem 2.1 [11] that the positive equilibrium points (\bar{x}, \bar{y}) is locally unstable.

3 Rate of Convergence

In this section we will determine the rate of convergence of a solution that converges to the equilibrium point (0*,* 0) of the system (1.1). The following result gives the rate of convergence of solution of a system of difference equations

$$
X_{n+1} = [P + Q(n)]X_n
$$
\n(3.1)

where X_n is a four dimensional vector, $P \in C^{4 \times 4}$ is a constant matrix, $Q: Z^+ \to C^{4 \times 4}$ is a matrix function satisfying

$$
||Q(n)|| \to 0, \text{when } n \to \infty. \tag{3.2}
$$

where *∥ · ∥* denotes any matrix norm which is associated with the vector norm.

Theorem 3.1.[21] *Assume that condition (3.2) hold, if* X_n *is a solution of (3.1), then either* $X_n = 0$ *for all large n or*

$$
\rho = \lim_{n \to \infty} \sqrt[n]{\|X_n\|} \tag{3.3}
$$

or

$$
\rho = \lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{\|X_{n+1}\|}{\|X_n\|} \tag{3.4}
$$

exists and is equal to the moduls of one the eigenvalues of the matrix P.

Assume that $\lim_{n\to\infty} x_n = \bar{x}$, $\lim_{n\to\infty} y_n = \bar{y}$, we will find a system of limiting equations for the system (1.1). The error terms are given as

$$
\begin{cases}\nx_{n+1} - \bar{x} = \sum_{i=0}^{1} P_i (x_{n-i} - \bar{x}) + \sum_{i=0}^{1} Q_i (y_{n-i} - \bar{y}) \\
y_{n+1} - \bar{y} = \sum_{i=0}^{1} R_i (x_{n-i} - \bar{x}) + \sum_{i=0}^{1} S_i (y_{n-i} - \bar{y})\n\end{cases}
$$

Set $e_n^1 = x_n - \bar{x}, e_n^2 = y_n - \bar{y}$, therefore it follows that

$$
\begin{cases}\ne_{n+1}^{1} = \sum_{i=0}^{1} P_{i} e_{n-i}^{1} + \sum_{i=0}^{1} Q_{i} e_{n-i}^{2} \\
e_{n+1}^{2} = \sum_{i=0}^{1} R_{i} e_{n-i}^{1} + \sum_{i=0}^{1} S_{i} e_{n-i}^{2}\n\end{cases}
$$

where

$$
P_0 = \frac{1}{A + y_n y_{n-1}}, P_1 = 0, Q_0 = -\frac{x_n y_{n-1}}{(A + y_n y_{n-1})^2}, Q_1 = -\frac{x_n y_n}{(A + y_n y_{n-1})^2}.
$$

\n
$$
R_0 = -\frac{x_{n-1} y_n}{(B + x_n x_{n-1})^2}, R_1 = -\frac{x_n y_n}{(B + x_n x_{n-1})^2}, S_0 = \frac{1}{B + x_n x_{n-1}}, S_1 = 0.
$$

Now it is clear that

$$
\lim_{n \to \infty} P_0 = \frac{1}{A}, \lim_{n \to \infty} Q_0 = \lim_{n \to \infty} Q_1 = 0, \lim_{n \to \infty} R_0 = \lim_{n \to \infty} R_1 = 0, \lim_{n \to \infty} S_0 = \frac{1}{B}.
$$

Hence, the limiting system of error terms at (0*,* 0) can be written as

$$
E_{n+1} = GE_n \tag{3.5}
$$

where $E_n = (e_n^1, e_{n-1}^1, e_n^2, e_{n-1}^2)^T$, and

$$
G = J_F(0,0) = (d_{ij})_{4 \times 4} = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{1}{A} & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & \frac{1}{B} & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \end{pmatrix}
$$

Using Theorem 3.1, we have the following result

Theorem 3.2. Assume that $A > 1, B > 1$, and $\{(x_n, y_n)\}\)$ be a positive solution of the system *(1.1). Then, the error vector* E_n *of every solution of (1.1) satisfies both of the following asymptotic relations*

$$
\lim_{n \to \infty} \sqrt[n]{\|E_n\|} = |\lambda J_F(0,0)|, \lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{\|E_{n+1}\|}{\|E_n\|} = |\lambda J_F(0,0)|.
$$

where $\lambda J_F(0,0)$ *is equal to the moduls of one the eigenvalues of the Jacobian matrix evaluted at the equilibrium* (0*,* 0)*.*

4 Numerical Examples

In order to illustrate the results of the previous sections and to support our theoretical discussions, we consider some interesting numerical examples in this section.

Example 4.1. *Consider the system (1.1) with initial conditions* $x_{-1} = 0.8, x_0 = 1.2, y_{-1} = 1.8, y_0 = 1.2$ 2.2*, Moreover, choosing the parameters* $A = 1.7, B = 1.5$ *. Then system (1.1) can be written as*

$$
x_{n+1} = \frac{x_n}{1.7 + y_n y_{n-1}}, \quad y_{n+1} = \frac{y_n}{1.5 + x_n x_{n-1}}
$$
(4.1)

The plot of system (4.1) is shown in Fig. 1.

Fig. 1. The plot of system (4.1)

Example 4.2. *Consider the system (1.1) with initial conditions* $x_{-1} = 4.8, x_0 = 4.6, y_{-1} = 5.8, y_0 = 0.01$ 5.2*, Moreover, choosing the parameters* $A = 0.7, B = 0.8$ *. Then system (1.1) can be written as*

$$
x_{n+1} = \frac{x_n}{0.7 + y_n y_{n-1}}, \quad y_{n+1} = \frac{y_n}{0.8 + x_n x_{n-1}}
$$
(4.2)

The plot of system (4.2) is shown in Fig. 2.

Fig. 2. The plot of system (4.2)

5 Conclusions

In this paper, the dynamical behavior of second-order discrete system is studied. It conclude that: *√* (i) the positive equilibrium point $(\sqrt{1-B}, \sqrt{1-A})$ is locally unstable if $0 < A < 1, 0 < B < 1$. (ii) the trivial equilibrium point $(0,0)$ is globally asymptotically stable if $A > 1, B > 1$. Some numerical examples are provided to support theoretical results.

Competing Interests

Author has declared that no competing interests exist.

References

- [1] Papaschinopoulos G, Schinas CJ. On a system of two nonlinear difference equations. J. Math. Anal. Appl. 1998;219:415-426.
- [2] Clark D, Kulenovic MRS, Selgrade JF. Global asymptotic behavior of a two-dimensional difference equation modelling competition. Nonlinear Analysis. 2003;52:1765-1776.
- [3] Kurbanli AS. On the behavior of solutions of the system of rational difference equations: $x_{n+1} = x_{n-1}/(y_n x_{n-1} - 1), Y_{n+1} = y_{n-1}/(x_n y_{n-1} - 1)$ and $z_{n+1} = z_{n-1}/(y_n z_{n-1} - 1).$ Discrete Dynamics in Nature and Society. 2011;12. Article ID 932632.
- [4] Cinar C, Yalcinkaya I, Karatas R. On the positive solutions of the difference equation system $x_{n+1} = \frac{m}{y_n}, y_{n+1} = \frac{py_n}{x_{n-1}y_{n-1}}$. J. Inst. Math. Comp. Sci. 2005;18:135-136.
- [5] Cinar C. On the positive solutions of the difference equation system $x_{n+1} = \frac{1}{y_n}$, $y_{n+1} = \frac{1}{y_n}$ *yn ^xn−*1*yn−*¹ , Applied Mathematics and Computation. 2004;158:303-305.
- [6] Clark D, Kulenovic MRS. A coupled system of rational difference equations. Computers and Mathematics with Applications. 2002;43:849-867.
- [7] Zhang Q, Yang L, Liu J. Dynamics of a system of rational third-order difference equation. Advances in Difference Equations. 2012;136:1-8.
- [8] Zhang Q, Liu J, Luo Z. Dynamical behavior of a system of third-order rational difference equation. Hindawi Publishing Corporation, Discrete Dynamics in Nature and Society. 2015;1- 6. Article ID 530453.
- [9] Ibrahim TF. Two-dimensional fractional system of nonlinear difference equations in the modeling competitive populations. International Journal of Basic and Applied Sciences. 2012;12(05):103-121.
- [10] Din Q, Qureshi MN, Khan AQ. Dynamics of a fourth-order system of rational difference equations. Advances in Difference Equations. 2012;215:1-15.
- [11] Kocic VL, Ladas G. Global behavior of nonlinear difference equations of higher order with application. Kluwer Academic Publishers, Dordrecht; 1993.
- [12] Liu K, Zhao Z, Li X, Li P. More on three-dimensional systems of rational difference equations. Discrete Dynamics in Nature and Society. 2011; Article ID 178483.
- [13] Ibrahim TF, Zhang Q. Stability of an anti-competitive system of rational difference Equations. Archives Des Sciences. 2013;66(5):44-58.
- [14] Zayed EME, El-Moneam MA. On the global attractivity of two nonlinear difference equations. J. Math. Sci. 2011;177:487-499.
- [15] Touafek N, Elsayed EM. On the periodicity of some systems of nonlinear difference equations. Bull. Math. Soc. Sci. Math. Roumanie. 2012;2:217-224.
- [16] Touafek N, Elsayed EM. On the solutions of systems of rational difference Equations. Mathematical and Computer Modelling. 2012;55:1987-1997.
- [17] Kalabusic S, Kulenovic MRS, Pilav E. Dynamics of a two-dimensional system of rational difference equations of Leslie–Gower type. Advances in Difference Equations; 2011. DOI: 10.1186/1687-1847-2011-29
- [18] Ibrahim TF. Boundedness and stability of a rational difference equation with delay. Rev. Roumaine Math.Pures Appl. 2012;57(3):215-224.
- [19] Ibrahim TF, Touafek N. On a third-order rational difference equation with variable coefficients. DCDIS Series B: Applications & Algorithms. 2013;20(2):251-264.
- [20] Ibrahim TF. Oscillation, non-oscillation, and asymptotic behavior for third order nonlinear gifference equations. Dynamics of Continuous, Discrete and Impulsive Systems, Series A: Mathematical Analysis. 2013;20(4):523-532.
- [21] Pituk M. More on Poincare's and Peron's theorems for difference equations. Journal Difference Equations and Applications. 2002;8:201-216.

 $\mathcal{L}=\{1,2,3,4\}$, we can consider the constant of $\mathcal{L}=\{1,2,3,4\}$ *⃝*c *2017 Bao; This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.*

Peer-review history:

The peer [review history for this paper can be accessed](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0) here (Please copy paste the total link in your browser address bar)

http://sciencedomain.org/review-history/20799